# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

AL BURROWS,

Plaintiff,

VS.

No. CIV-10-0522 MCA/LAM

VERIZON WIRELESS JOHN DOES and JANE DOES,<sup>1</sup>

Defendants.

#### STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

# 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation would be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled under the applicable legal principles to treatment as confidential.

#### 2. **DEFINITIONS**

- 2.1 <u>Party</u>: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and outside counsel (and their support staff).
- 2.2 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>It should be noted that the Court modified the caption submitted by the parties to reflect the only remaining Defendants since Vodafone Group PLC d/b/a Verizon Wireless and Verizon Communications Inc. were terminated as parties on March 25, 2011. The parties should submit all future pleadings and documents containing the correct caption.

- 2.3 <u>"Confidential" Information or Items</u>: information (regardless of how generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that a Producing Party (as defined in Section 2.5) makes available for inspection or otherwise produces in this action, and which the Producing Party believes in good faith contains trade secrets, confidential and/or proprietary commercial information, or private information of an individual, customer, or consumer the Producing Party would not normally reveal to third parties except in confidence, or is restricted by statute, regulation, or agreement from disclosure.
- 2.4 <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.
- 2.5 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or non-party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this action.
- 2.6 <u>Designating Party</u>: a Party or non-party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "Confidential."
- 2.7 <u>Protected Material</u>: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "Confidential."
- 2.8 <u>Outside Counsel</u>: attorneys who are not employees of a Party but who are retained to represent or advise a Party in this action.
  - 2.9 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a Party.
- 2.10 <u>Counsel (without qualifier)</u>: Outside Counsel and House Counsel (as well as their support staffs).
- 2.11 <u>Expert</u>: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action and who is not a past or a current

employee of a Party or of a competitor of a Party's and who, at the time of retention, is not anticipated to become an employee of a Party or a competitor of a Party's. This definition includes a professional jury or trial consultant retained in connection with this litigation.

2.12 <u>Professional Vendors</u>: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or demonstrations; organizing, storing, retrieving data in any form or medium; etc.) and their employees and subcontractors.

#### 3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or counsel to or in court or in other settings that might reveal Protected Material.

#### 4. **DURATION**

Even after the termination of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs.

### 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

Each Party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. A Designating Party must take care to designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or

communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. If it comes to a Party's or a non-party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection at all, or do not qualify for the level of protection initially asserted, that Party or non-party must promptly notify all other parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a), below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (apart from transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" at the top or bottom of each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or non-party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions

thereof, qualify for protection under this Order, then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL" legend at the top or bottom of each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

- (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the testimony identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony, and further specify any portions of the testimony that qualify as "CONFIDENTIAL." When it is impractical to identify separately each portion of testimony that is entitled to protection, and when it appears that substantial portions of the testimony may qualify for protection, the Party or non-party that sponsors, offers, or gives the testimony may invoke on the record (before the deposition or proceeding is concluded) a right to have up to 20 days after receipt of the transcript to identify the specific portions of the testimony as to which protection is sought. Only those portions of the testimony that are appropriately designated for protection within the 20 days shall be covered by the provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order.
- (c) Transcript pages containing Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter, who must affix to the top of each such page the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" as instructed by the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the witness or presenting the testimony.
- (d) for information produced in some form other than documentary, and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on

the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portions.

5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items as "CONFIDENTIAL" does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. If material is appropriately designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" after the material was initially produced, the Receiving Party, on timely notification of the designation, must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

#### 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

- Designating Party's confidentiality designation must do so in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not sufficient) with counsel for the Designating Party. In conferring, the challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation.

  A challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first.
- 6.2 <u>Judicial Intervention</u>. A Party that elects to press a challenge to a confidentiality designation after considering the justification offered by the

Designating Party must file and serve a motion to challenge the confidentiality designation within 30 days of receiving the Protected Material. A Party that does not file and serve a motion to challenge the confidentiality designation within 30 days of receiving the Protected Material waives its right to challenge a Designating Party's confidentiality designation. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Until the Court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation.

# 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 11, below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless</u>

otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a

Receiving Party may disclose information or item designated CONFIDENTIAL only to:

- (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;
- (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation;
- (c) experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);
  - (d) the Court and its personnel pursuant to section 10 below;
- (e) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);
- (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A). Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.
- (g) the author of the document or the original source of the information.

# 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Receiving Party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation that would compel disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as

"CONFIDENTIAL," the Receiving Party must so notify the Designating Party, in writing (by email, if possible) immediately and in no event more than three court days after receiving the subpoena or order. Such notification must include a copy of the subpoena or court order.

The Receiving Party also must immediately inform in writing the Party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all the material covered by the subpoena or order is the subject of this Protective Order. In addition, the Receiving Party must deliver a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order promptly to the Party in the other action that caused the subpoena or order to issue.

The purpose of imposing these duties is to alert the interested parties to the existence of this Protective Order and to afford the Designating Party in this case an opportunity to try to protect its confidentiality interests in the court from which the subpoena or order issued. The Designating Party shall bear the burdens and the expenses of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

### 9. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

#### 10. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL

A Party that intends to submit to the Court any Protected Material in this action must submit such Protected Material under seal to prevent disclosure of the Protected Material to the public.

#### 11. FINAL DISPOSITION

Unless otherwise ordered or agreed in writing by the Producing Party, within sixty days after the final termination of this action, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other form of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. With permission in writing from the Designating Party, the Receiving Party may destroy some or all of the Protected Material instead of returning it. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the sixty day deadline that identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and that affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or other forms of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence or attorney work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION), above.

# 12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 **Right to Further Relief.** Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 **Right to Assert Other Objections.** By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

Lourdes a Martinez LOURDES A. MARTINEZ

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

Prepared and Submitted by (*Prior to modifications by the Court*):

DATED: June 10, 2011. REED SMITH LLP

<u>/s/ Jordan Yu</u>

Jordan S. Yu, Esq. Abraham J. Colman, Esq. 355 South Grand Avenue #2900 Los Angeles, California 90071 (213) 4578301 Fax (213) 457-8080 jsyu@reedsmith.com

Attorneys for Defendant Verizon Wireless (VAW) LLC

DATED: June 10, 2010. SCHERR & LEGATE, PLLC

/s/ Joseph G. Isaac

Joseph G. Isaac, Esq Joseph F. Scherr, Esq. Sam J. Legate, Esq. 109 North Oregon, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor El Paso, Texas 79901 (915) 544-0100 Fax (915) 532-1759 jisaac@slelaw.com jamesscherr@slelaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

# **EXHIBIT A**

# ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, [print or type full name], of
[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety
and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States
District Court, District of New Mexico, on [date] in the case of Burrows v.
Verizon Wireless, Case No. CIV-10-0522 MCA/LAM. I agree to comply with and to be
bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and
acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in
the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any
information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or
entity except in strict compliance with the provision of this Order.
I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court,
District of New Mexico, for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this
action.
Date: _
City and State where sworn and signed:
Printed name:
Signature: